

THE ERDÖS AND CAMPBELL-STATON CONJECTURES ABOUT SQUARE PACKING

IWAN PRATON

ABSTRACT. Put n open non-overlapping squares inside a unit square, and let $f(n)$ denote the maximum possible value of the sum of the side lengths of the n squares. Campbell and Staton, building on a question of Erdős, conjectured that $f(k^2 + 2c + 1) = k + c/k$, where c is any integer and $k \geq |c|$. We show that if this conjecture is true for one value of c , then it is true for all values of c .

Let n be a positive integer. Put n open non-overlapping squares inside a unit square. If $e_1, e_2, \dots, e_n$ are the side lengths of the squares, then define $f(n) = \max\{e_1 + e_2 + \dots + e_n\}$. It is not hard to show that $f(k^2) = k$; for a proof see [1]. In the beginning of [2], it is mentioned that $f(k^2 + 1) = k$ is an old conjecture of Erdős. Apparently not much work was done on this problem—even [2] is mostly about packing unit squares in a larger square—but in [1], Campbell and Staton revived the question, provided some nice lower bounds for $f(n)$, and conjectured that their lower bounds are actually exact.

In this short note we show that the Erdős conjecture implies the Campbell-Staton conjectures. Of course, we should describe the conjectures first. Let c be any integer. Then the Erdős and Campbell-Staton conjectures can be described succinctly as follows:

$$(*) \quad f(k^2 + 2c + 1) = k + c/k \text{ for all } k \geq |c|.$$

When $c = 0$ we get the Erdős conjecture; Campbell and Staton put forth all the other values of c . They also showed, by explicit construction, that $f(k^2 + 2c + 1) \geq k + c/k$ for all $k \geq |c|$, so all that remains to prove the conjecture is to provide the appropriate upper bound. Note that if n is any nonsquare integer, then n is an odd integer away from a neighboring square, so $(*)$ provides a complete description of the function f .

We'll show that if $(*)$ is true for one value of c , then it is true for all values of c . In particular, as stated above, the truth of the Erdős conjecture implies the truth of the Campbell-Staton conjectures. Let $P(c)$ denote the statement $(*)$. It clearly suffices to show that

$$P(c - 1) \implies P(c) \text{ and } P(c + 1) \implies P(c);$$

we'll show this after deriving a general upper bound for $f(n)$.

Take a unit square and divide it into the standard $b \times b$ grid of squares, each with side length $1/b$. Remove an $a \times a$ subsquare, and replace it with an optimal configuration of n squares, shrunk by a factor of b/a so that it fits inside the $a \times a$ space. We now have a configuration of $b^2 - a^2 + n$ squares inside the unit square. The sum of the side lengths of these squares is $af(n)/b + (b^2 - a^2)/b$. This is at most $f(b^2 - a^2 + n)$, so we have $af(n)/b + (b^2 - a^2)/b \leq f(b^2 - a^2 + n)$. Solving for $f(n)$ gives us an upper bound for $f(n)$:

$$(**) \quad f(n) \leq a - \frac{b^2}{a} + \frac{b}{a}f(b^2 - a^2 + n).$$

We now prove that $P(c - 1) \implies P(c)$. Let $k \geq |c|$, and put $n = k^2 + 2c + 1$, $a = k - 1$, $b = k$ in $(**)$. Then $b^2 - a^2 + n = 2k - 1 + k^2 + 2c + 1 = (k + 1)^2 + (2c - 1) = (k + 1)^2 + 2(c - 1) + 1$.

Note that $k+1 \geq |c-1|$, so we can apply $P(c-1)$, i.e., $f(b^2 - a^2 + n) = k+1 + (c-1)/(k+1) = k + (k+c)/(k+1)$. Thus $(**)$ becomes

$$\begin{aligned} f(k^2 + 2c + 1) &\leq k - 1 - \frac{k^2}{k-1} + \frac{k}{k-1} \left(k + \frac{k+c}{k+1} \right) \\ &= k + \frac{c}{k} + \frac{k+c}{k(k^2-1)}. \end{aligned}$$

after some straightforward calculations.

This is not quite what we want—it's too big by $(k+c)/(k(k^2-1))$. But we can use $(**)$ again. Let $n = k^2 + (2c+1)$ as before, but now let $a = k$ and keep b arbitrary. Then $b^2 - a^2 + n = b^2 + (2c+1)$. We get

$$\begin{aligned} f(k^2 + 2c + 1) &\leq k - \frac{b^2}{k} + \frac{b}{k} f(b^2 + (2c+1)) \\ &\leq k - \frac{b^2}{k} + \frac{b}{k} \left(b + \frac{c}{b} + \frac{b+c}{b(b^2-1)} \right) \\ &= k + \frac{c}{k} + \frac{b+c}{k(b^2-1)}. \end{aligned}$$

Now let $b \rightarrow \infty$. We get

$$f(k^2 + 2c + 1) \leq k + c/k,$$

which, in conjunction with the Campbell-Staton lower bounds, gives us what we want.

The implication $P(c+1) \implies P(c)$ is proved similarly, but we use $n = k^2 + 2c + 1$, $a = k + 1$, and $b = k + 2$ in the first step. Details are left to the reader.

As a final remark, note that in order to prove the conjectures completely, it is enough to show that $f(k^2 + 2c + 1) = k + c/k + \epsilon(k)$, where $k\epsilon(k) \rightarrow 0$ as $k \rightarrow \infty$. To do this it is probably necessary to consider the detailed placements of the small squares in the unit square.

REFERENCES

- [1] C. Campbell and W. Staton, A Square Packing Problem of Erdős, *American Mathematical Monthly* **112** (2005) 165–167.
- [2] P. Erdős and R. Graham, On Packing Squares with Equal Squares, *J. Combin. Th. Ser A* **19** (1975) 119–123.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, FRANKLIN AND MARSHALL COLLEGE, LANCASTER PA 17604
E-mail address: iwan.praton@fandm.edu